

Suggested solution to Assignment 3

1. (a) Write down the tableau and perform pivot operations successively.
The pivoting entries are marked with asterisks.

	y_1	y_2	y_3	-1
x_1	3	2	2	15
x_2	0	4^*	5	24
-1	3	5	4	-12

→

	y_1	y_2	y_3	-1
x_1	3^*	$-\frac{1}{2}$	$-\frac{1}{2}$	3
y_2	0	$\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{5}{4}$	6
-1	3	$-\frac{5}{4}$	$-\frac{9}{4}$	-42

	x_1	x_2	y_3	-1
y_1	$\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{1}{6}$	$-\frac{1}{6}$	1
y_2	0	$\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{5}{4}$	6
-1	-1	$-\frac{3}{4}$	$-\frac{7}{4}$	-45

The independent variables are y_3, y_4, y_5 and the basic variables are y_1, y_2 . The basic solution is

$$y_3 = y_4 = y_5 = 0, \quad y_1 = 1, \quad y_2 = 6.$$

Thus an optimal vector for the primal problem is

$$(y_1, y_2, y_3) = (1, 6, 0)$$

The maximum value of f is 45.

The dual problem is

$$\min g = 15x_1 + 24x_2 + 12$$

$$\text{subject to } 3x_1 \geq 3$$

$$2x_1 + 4x_2 \geq 5$$

$$2x_1 + 5x_2 \geq 4$$

From the above tableau, the independent variables are x_3, x_4 and the basic variables are x_1, x_2, x_5 . The basic solution is

$$x_3 = x_4 = 0, \quad x_1 = 1, \quad x_2 = \frac{3}{4}, \quad x_5 = \frac{7}{4}.$$

Therefore an optimal vector for the dual problem is

$$(x_1, x_2) = (1, \frac{3}{4})$$

The minimum value of g is 45 which is equal to the maximum value of f .

(b) Write down the tableau and perform pivot operations successively.
The pivoting entries are marked with asterisks.

	y_1	y_2	y_3	y_4	-1
x_1	3	1	1	4	12
x_2	1	-3	2	3	7
x_3	2	1^*	3	-1	10
-1	2	4	3	1	0

→

	y_1	y_3	y_3	x_1	-1
y_4	$\frac{1}{5}$	$-\frac{1}{5}$	$-\frac{2}{5}$	$\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{2}{5}$
x_2	7	3	11	0	37
y_2	$\frac{11}{5}$	$\frac{4}{5}$	$\frac{13}{5}$	$\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{52}{5}$
-1	-7	3	-7	-1	-42

The independent variables are y_1, y_3, y_5, y_7 and the basic variables are y_2, y_4, y_6 . The basic solution is

$$y_1 = y_3 = y_5 = y_7 = 0, y_2 = \frac{52}{5}, y_4 = \frac{2}{5}, y_6 = 37$$

Thus an optimal vector for the primal problem is
 $(y_1, y_2, y_3, y_4) = (0, \frac{52}{5}, 0, \frac{2}{5})$

The maximum value of f is 42.

The dual problem is

$$\min g = 12x_1 + 7x_2 + 10x_3$$

$$\text{subject to } 3x_1 + x_2 + 2x_3 \geq 2$$

$$x_1 - 3x_2 + x_3 \geq 4$$

$$x_1 + 2x_2 + 3x_3 \geq 3$$

$$4x_1 + 3x_2 - x_3 \geq 1$$

From the above tableau, the independent variables are x_2, x_5, x_7 and the basic variables are x_1, x_3, x_4, x_6 . The basic solution is

$$x_2 = x_5 = x_7 = 0, x_1 = 1, x_3 = 3, x_4 = x_6 = 7$$

Therefore an optimal vector for the dual problem is

$$(x_1, x_2, x_3) = (1, 0, 3)$$

The minimum value of g is 42 which is equal to the maximum value of f .

2(a) Add $k=3$ to every entry to get

$$\begin{pmatrix} 5 & 0 & 6 \\ 1 & 6 & 4 \\ 4 & 4 & 8 \end{pmatrix}$$

Applying simplex algorithm, we have

$$\begin{array}{c|ccc|c} & y_1 & y_2 & y_3 & -1 \\ \hline x_1 & 5^* & 0 & 6 & 1 \\ x_2 & 1 & 6 & 4 & 1 \\ x_3 & 4 & 4 & 8 & 1 \\ \hline -1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \end{array} \rightarrow \begin{array}{c|ccc|c} & x_1 & x_2 & x_3 & -1 \\ \hline y_1 & \frac{1}{5} & 0 & \frac{6}{5} & \frac{1}{5} \\ y_2 & -\frac{1}{5} & 6 & \frac{14}{5} & \frac{4}{5} \\ y_3 & -\frac{4}{5} & 4^* & \frac{16}{5} & \frac{1}{5} \\ \hline -1 & -\frac{1}{5} & 1 & -\frac{1}{5} & -\frac{1}{5} \end{array} \rightarrow \begin{array}{c|ccc|c} & x_1 & x_3 & y_3 & -1 \\ \hline y_1 & \frac{1}{5} & 0 & \frac{6}{5} & \frac{1}{5} \\ x_2 & 1 & -\frac{3}{2} & -2 & \frac{1}{2} \\ y_2 & -\frac{1}{5} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{4}{5} & \frac{1}{20} \\ \hline -1 & 0 & -\frac{1}{4} & -1 & -\frac{1}{4} \end{array}$$

The independent variables are x_2, x_4, x_5 ; y_3, y_4, y_6 and the basic variables are x_1, x_3, x_6 ; y_1, y_2, y_5 . The basic solution is

$$x_2 = x_4 = x_5 = 0, x_1 = 0, x_3 = \frac{1}{4}, x_6 = 1$$

$$y_3 = y_4 = y_6 = 0, y_1 = \frac{1}{5}, y_2 = \frac{1}{20}, y_5 = \frac{1}{2}$$

The optimal value is $d = \frac{1}{4}$.

Therefore a maximin strategy for the row player is

$$\vec{p} = \frac{1}{d}(x_1, x_2, x_3) = (0, 0, 1)$$

a minimax strategy for the column player is

$$\vec{q} = \frac{1}{d}(y_1, y_2, y_3) = (\frac{4}{5}, \frac{1}{5}, 0)$$

The value of the game is $V = \frac{1}{d} - k = 1$.

(b) Add $k=5$ to every entry to get

$$\begin{pmatrix} 8 & 6 & 0 \\ 4 & 3 & 11 \\ 3 & 4 & 7 \end{pmatrix}$$

Applying simplex algorithm, we have

$$\begin{array}{c|ccc|c} & y_1 & y_2 & y_3 & -1 \\ \hline x_1 & 8^* & 6 & 0 & 1 \\ x_2 & 4 & 3 & 11 & 1 \\ x_3 & 3 & 4 & 7 & 1 \\ \hline -1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 0 \end{array} \rightarrow \begin{array}{c|ccc|c} & x_1 & x_2 & x_3 & -1 \\ \hline y_1 & \frac{1}{8} & \frac{3}{4} & 0 & \frac{1}{8} \\ x_2 & -\frac{1}{8} & 0 & 1^* & \frac{1}{8} \\ x_3 & -\frac{3}{8} & \frac{7}{4} & 7 & \frac{5}{8} \\ \hline -1 & -\frac{1}{8} & \frac{1}{4} & 1 & -\frac{1}{8} \end{array} \rightarrow \begin{array}{c|ccc|c} & x_1 & x_2 & x_2 & -1 \\ \hline y_1 & \frac{1}{8} & \frac{3}{4}^* & 0 & \frac{1}{8} \\ y_3 & -\frac{1}{22} & 0 & \frac{1}{11} & \frac{1}{22} \\ x_3 & -\frac{5}{88} & \frac{7}{4} & -\frac{11}{11} & \frac{27}{88} \\ \hline -1 & -\frac{7}{88} & \frac{1}{4} & -\frac{11}{11} & -\frac{15}{88} \end{array}$$

	x_1	y_1	x_2	-1
y_2	$\frac{1}{6}$	$\frac{4}{3}$	0	$\frac{1}{6}$
y_3	$-\frac{1}{22}$	0	$\frac{1}{11}$	$\frac{1}{22}$
y_4	$-\frac{23}{66}$	$-\frac{7}{3}$	$-\frac{7}{11}$	$\frac{35}{132}$
-1	$-\frac{4}{33}$	$-\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{1}{11}$	$-\frac{1}{33}$

Thus $x_3 = x_5 = x_6 = 0$, $x_1 = \frac{4}{33}$, $x_2 = \frac{1}{11}$, $x_4 = \frac{1}{3}$

$y_1 = y_4 = y_5 = 0$, $y_2 = \frac{1}{6}$, $y_3 = \frac{1}{22}$, $y_6 = \frac{35}{132}$.

$$d = \frac{7}{33}.$$

Therefore a maximin strategy for the row player is

$$\vec{p} = \frac{1}{d}(x_1, x_2, x_3) = \left(\frac{4}{7}, \frac{3}{7}, 0\right)$$

a minimax strategy for the column player is

$$\vec{q} = \frac{1}{d}(y_1, y_2, y_3) = \left(0, \frac{1}{14}, \frac{3}{14}\right)$$

The value of the game is $v = \frac{1}{d} - k = -\frac{2}{7}$.

(c) Add $k=2$ to every entry to get

$$\begin{pmatrix} 5 & 2 & 3 \\ 1 & 4 & 0 \\ 2 & 3 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

Applying simplex algorithm, we have

	y_1	y_2	y_3	-1
x_1	5*	2	3	1
x_2	1	4	0	1
x_3	2	3	1	1
-1	1	1	1	0

	x_1	y_2	y_3	-1
y_1	$\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{2}{5}$	$\frac{3}{5}$	$\frac{1}{5}$
x_2	$-\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{18}{5}$ *	$-\frac{3}{5}$	$\frac{4}{5}$
y_3	$-\frac{2}{5}$	$\frac{11}{5}$	$-\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{3}{5}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{3}{5}$	$\frac{2}{5}$	$-\frac{1}{5}$

	x_1	x_2	y_3	-1
y_1	$\frac{2}{9}$	$-\frac{1}{9}$	$\frac{2}{3}$ *	$\frac{1}{9}$
y_2	$-\frac{1}{18}$	$\frac{5}{18}$	$-\frac{1}{6}$	$\frac{2}{9}$
y_3	$-\frac{5}{18}$	$-\frac{11}{18}$	$\frac{1}{6}$	$\frac{1}{9}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{6}$	$-\frac{1}{6}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	$-\frac{1}{3}$

	x_1	x_2	y_1	-1
y_3	$\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{1}{6}$	$\frac{3}{2}$	$\frac{1}{6}$
y_2	0	$\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{1}{4}$
y_3	$-\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{7}{12}$	$-\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{1}{12}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{1}{12}$	$-\frac{3}{4}$	$-\frac{5}{12}$

Thus $x_3 = x_5 = x_6 = 0$, $x_1 = \frac{1}{3}$, $x_2 = \frac{1}{12}$, $x_4 = \frac{3}{4}$

$y_1 = y_4 = y_5 = 0$, $y_2 = \frac{1}{4}$, $y_3 = \frac{1}{6}$, $y_6 = \frac{1}{12}$

Therefore $d = \frac{5}{12}$. A maximin strategy for the row player is

$$\vec{p} = \frac{1}{d}(x_1, x_2, x_3) = \left(\frac{4}{5}, \frac{1}{5}, 0\right)$$

A minimax strategy for the column player is $\vec{q} = \frac{1}{d}(y_1, y_2, y_3) = (0, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{5})$.

The value of the game is $v = \frac{1}{d} - k = \frac{2}{5}$.

(d) Add $k=3$ to every entry to get $\begin{pmatrix} 5 & 3 & 1 \\ 2 & 0 & 6 \\ 1 & 5 & 3 \end{pmatrix}$

Applying simplex algorithm, we have

x_1	y_1	y_2	y_3	-1
x_1	5*	3	1	1
x_2	2	0	6	1
x_3	1	5	3	1
-1	1	1	1	0

x_1	y_1	y_2	y_3	-1
x_1	$\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{3}{5}$	$\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{1}{5}$
x_2	$-\frac{2}{5}$	$-\frac{6}{5}$	$\frac{28}{5}$ *	$\frac{3}{5}$
x_3	$-\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{22}{5}$	$\frac{14}{5}$	$\frac{4}{5}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{5}$	$\frac{2}{5}$	$\frac{4}{5}$	$-\frac{1}{5}$

x_1	y_1	y_2	y_3	-1
x_1	$\frac{3}{14}$	$\frac{9}{14}$	$-\frac{1}{28}$	$\frac{5}{28}$
x_3	$-\frac{1}{14}$	$-\frac{3}{14}$	$\frac{5}{28}$	$\frac{3}{28}$
x_3	0	5^*	$-\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{2}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{7}$	$\frac{4}{7}$	$-\frac{1}{7}$	$-\frac{2}{7}$

$$\text{Thus } x_4 = x_5 = x_6 = 0, x_1 = \frac{1}{7}, x_2 = \frac{3}{35}, x_3 = \frac{4}{35}$$

$$y_4 = y_5 = y_6 = 0, y_1 = \frac{4}{35}, y_2 = \frac{1}{10}, y_3 = \frac{9}{70}$$

$$d = \frac{12}{35}.$$

Therefore a maximum strategy is $\vec{p} = \frac{1}{d}(x_1, x_2, x_3) = (\frac{5}{12}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{1}{3})$.

A minimax strategy for column player is $\vec{q} = \frac{1}{d}(y_1, y_2, y_3) = (\frac{1}{3}, \frac{7}{24}, \frac{3}{8})$

The value of the game is $v = \frac{1}{d} - k = -\frac{1}{12}$.

(e) Add $k=2$ to every entry to get

3	1	3
0	2	1
3	0	4
1	3	0

Applying simplex algorithm, we have

x_1	y_1	y_2	y_3	-1
x_1	3*	1	3	1
x_2	0	2	1	1
x_3	3	0	4	1
x_4	1	3	0	1
-1	1	1	1	0

x_1	x_4	y_1	-1
x_3	$\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{1}{9}$	$\frac{8}{9}$ *
x_2	$-\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{5}{9}$	$-\frac{14}{9}$
x_3	$-\frac{4}{3}$	$\frac{4}{9}$	$-\frac{5}{9}$
y_2	0	$\frac{1}{3}$	$\frac{1}{3}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{2}{9}$	$-\frac{2}{9}$

x_1	x_4	y_3	-1
x_1	$\frac{9}{24}$	$-\frac{1}{8}$	$\frac{9}{8}^*$
x_2	$-\frac{1}{4}$	$-\frac{3}{4}$	$\frac{1}{4}$
x_3	$-\frac{9}{8}$	$\frac{3}{8}$	$\frac{5}{8}$
y_2	$-\frac{1}{8}$	$\frac{3}{8}$	$-\frac{3}{8}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{4}$	$-\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{1}{4}$

$$\text{Thus } x_2 = x_3 = x_6 = x_7 = 0, x_1 = \frac{1}{3}, x_4 = \frac{2}{9}, x_5 = \frac{2}{9}$$

$$y_1 = y_4 = y_7 = 0, y_2 = \frac{1}{3}, y_3 = \frac{2}{9}, y_5 = \frac{1}{9}, y_6 = \frac{1}{9}$$

$$d = \frac{5}{9}.$$

Therefore a maximum strategy is $\vec{p} = \frac{1}{d}(x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4) = (\frac{3}{5}, 0, 0, \frac{2}{5})$.

A minimax strategy is $\vec{q} = \frac{1}{d}(y_1, y_2, y_3) = (0, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{5})$. The value is $v = \frac{1}{d} - k = -\frac{1}{5}$.

(f) Add $k=3$ to every entry to get

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 5 & 3 \\ 4 & 1 & 2 \\ 2 & 3 & 5 \\ 4 & 4 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

Applying simplex algorithm, we have

	x_1	x_2	y_3	-1		x_2	y_2	y_3	-1		x_2	x_4	y_3	-1		
x_1	0	5	3	1		x_1	0	5	3	1		x_1	$\frac{5}{3}$	$-\frac{5}{3}$	$\frac{19}{3}$	1
x_2	4^*	1	2	1	→	y_1	$\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{1}{4}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{1}{4}$	→	y_1	$\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{1}{12}$	$\frac{2}{3}$	$\frac{1}{4}$
x_3	2	3	5	1		x_3	$-\frac{1}{2}$	$\frac{5}{2}$	4	$\frac{1}{2}$		x_3	$\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{5}{6}$	$\frac{17}{3}^*$	$\frac{1}{2}$
x_4	4	4	0	1		x_4	-1	3^*	-2	0		y_2	$-\frac{1}{3}$	$\frac{1}{3}$	$-\frac{2}{3}$	0
-1	1	1	1	0		-1	$-\frac{1}{4}$	$-\frac{3}{4}$	$\frac{1}{2}$	$-\frac{1}{4}$		-1	0	$-\frac{1}{4}$	1	$-\frac{1}{4}$

	x_2	x_4	y_3	-1
x_1	$\frac{22}{77}$	$-\frac{35}{34}$	$-\frac{19}{77}$	$\frac{15}{34}$
y_1	$\frac{5}{77}$	$\frac{1}{68}$	$-\frac{2}{77}$	$\frac{13}{68}$
y_3	$\frac{1}{77}$	$-\frac{5}{34}$	$\frac{3}{77}$	$\frac{3}{34}$
y_2	$-\frac{5}{77}$	$\frac{4}{77}$	$\frac{2}{77}$	$\frac{1}{77}$
-1	$-\frac{1}{77}$	$-\frac{7}{68}$	$-\frac{3}{77}$	$-\frac{23}{68}$

$$\text{Thus } x_1 = x_5 = x_6 = x_7 = 0, x_2 = \frac{1}{77}, x_4 = \frac{7}{68}, x_3 = \frac{3}{77}.$$

$$y_5 = y_6 = y_7 = 0, y_1 = \frac{13}{68}, y_2 = \frac{1}{77}, y_3 = \frac{3}{34}, y_4 = \frac{15}{34}$$

$$d = \frac{23}{68}.$$

Therefore a maximin strategy for the row player is $\vec{p} = (0, \frac{4}{23}, \frac{12}{23}, \frac{7}{23})$.

A minimax strategy for the column player is $\vec{q} = (\frac{13}{23}, \frac{4}{23}, \frac{6}{23})$.

The value of the game is $V = \frac{1}{d} - k = -\frac{1}{23}$.

3. Pf(a) For $x_1, x_2 \in C_1 \cap C_2, \lambda \in [0,1]$, $y \triangleq \lambda x_1 + (1-\lambda)x_2$

Due to convexity of C_1, C_2 , $\lambda x_1 + (1-\lambda)x_2 \in C_1, \lambda x_1 + (1-\lambda)x_2 \in C_2$.

That is, $y \in C_1 \cap C_2$. Hence $C_1 \cap C_2$ is convex. \square

(b) For $x = x_1 + x_2 \in C_1 + C_2$, $y = y_1 + y_2 \in C_1 + C_2$, $\lambda \in [0,1]$, where $x_1, y_1 \in C_1, x_2, y_2 \in C_2$.

$$z = \lambda x + (1-\lambda)y = \lambda x_1 + (1-\lambda)y_1 + \lambda x_2 + (1-\lambda)y_2$$

Since C_1, C_2 are convex, we have

$$\lambda x_1 + (1-\lambda)y_1 \in C_1, \lambda x_2 + (1-\lambda)y_2 \in C_2$$

So $z = \lambda x + (1-\lambda)y \in C_1 + C_2$. Hence $C_1 + C_2$ is convex. \square

4.pf. Let the set of maximin strategy for the row player of A be C, and let v be the value of the game with game matrix A.

Suppose $\vec{u}, \vec{v} \in C$, $\vec{u} = (u_1, \dots, u_n)$, $\vec{v} = (v_1, \dots, v_n)$ such that

$\vec{u}^T A \vec{y}^T \geq v$ and $\vec{v}^T A \vec{y}^T \geq v$ for any $\vec{y} \in P^m$, where

$$\sum_{i=1}^n u_i = \sum_{i=1}^n v_i = 1.$$

For $\lambda \in [0, 1]$, let $\vec{z} = \lambda \vec{u} + (1-\lambda) \vec{v}$, then $z_i = \lambda u_i + (1-\lambda) v_i$.

$$\text{Hence } \sum_{i=1}^n z_i = \lambda \sum_{i=1}^n u_i + (1-\lambda) \sum_{i=1}^n v_i = \lambda + (1-\lambda) = 1.$$

$$\begin{aligned} \vec{z}^T A \vec{y}^T &= [\lambda \vec{u} + (1-\lambda) \vec{v}]^T A \vec{y}^T = \lambda \vec{u}^T A \vec{y}^T + (1-\lambda) \vec{v}^T A \vec{y}^T \\ &\geq v\lambda + (1-\lambda)v \\ &= v. \quad \forall \vec{y} \in P^m. \end{aligned}$$

So $\vec{z} \in C$. That is, C is convex.

5.(a) $\exists \lambda \in [0, 1]$ such that $\vec{z} = \lambda \vec{x} + (1-\lambda) \vec{y}$.

Since \vec{z} is orthogonal to $\vec{x} - \vec{y}$, we have

$$\langle \vec{x} - \vec{y}, \vec{z} \rangle = 0, \text{ i.e. } \langle \vec{x} - \vec{y}, \lambda \vec{x} + (1-\lambda) \vec{y} \rangle = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \lambda \|\vec{x}\|^2 - \lambda \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle + (1-\lambda) \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle - (1-\lambda) \|\vec{y}\|^2 = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \lambda (\|\vec{x}\|^2 - 2 \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle + \|\vec{y}\|^2) = \|\vec{y}\|^2 - \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle$$

$$\Rightarrow \lambda = \frac{\|\vec{y}\|^2 - \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle}{\|\vec{x} - \vec{y}\|^2}, \quad 1-\lambda = \frac{\langle \vec{x}, \vec{x} - \vec{y} \rangle}{\|\vec{x} - \vec{y}\|^2} = \frac{\|\vec{x}\|^2 - \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle}{\|\vec{x} - \vec{y}\|^2}.$$

$$\text{Hence } \vec{z} = \frac{\|\vec{y}\|^2 - \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle}{\|\vec{x} - \vec{y}\|^2} \vec{x} + \frac{\|\vec{x}\|^2 - \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle}{\|\vec{x} - \vec{y}\|^2} \vec{y}.$$

Pf. (b) If $\langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle < 0$, then

$$\langle \vec{y}, \vec{y} \rangle = \|\vec{y}\|^2 - \langle \vec{x}, \vec{y} \rangle > 0, \quad \langle \vec{x} - \vec{y}, \vec{y} \rangle = \|\vec{y}\|^2 - \langle \vec{y}, \vec{x} \rangle > 0.$$

Hence \vec{z} lies on the line segment joining \vec{x} and \vec{y} .

So $\vec{z} \in C$ because of convexity of C.

6. Sol1: We suppose that $\vec{0} \notin C$.

By hypothesis, C is the convex hull of $\{\vec{a}_1, \vec{a}_2, \dots, \vec{a}_n, \vec{e}_1, \vec{e}_2, \dots, \vec{e}_m\}$.

Then by lemma 3.4.6 of lecture notes, there exists $\vec{z} = (z_1, z_2, \dots, z_m) \in \mathbb{R}^m$

such that $\langle \vec{z}, \vec{y} \rangle > 0$ for any $\vec{y} \in C$.

In particular, we have $\langle \vec{z}, \vec{e}_i \rangle = z_i > 0$ for any $i = 1, 2, \dots, m$.

Then we take $\vec{z} = \frac{\vec{z}}{z_1 + z_2 + \dots + z_m} \in P^m$.

And we have

$$\langle \vec{z}, \vec{a}_j \rangle = \frac{\langle \vec{z}, \vec{a}_j \rangle}{z_1 + z_2 + \dots + z_m} > 0 \text{ for any } j = 1, 2, \dots, n.$$

which means $\vec{z}A > \vec{0}$.

Let $\alpha > 0$ be the smallest coordinate of the vector $\vec{z}A$ and we have

$$V_r(A) \geq \min_{y \in P^m} \vec{z}A y^T > \alpha > 0.$$

It has been proved that $V_r(A) \leq V_c(A)$ for any matrix A (Theorem 3.4.3 of lecture notes).

Hence $V_c(A) \geq V_r(A) > 0$, which contradicts with $V_c(A) \leq 0$.

Therefore, if $V_c(A) \leq 0$, then $\vec{0} \in C$.

Sol2: By the definition of $V_c(A)$, if $V_c(A) \leq 0$, then $A \vec{y}^T = \begin{pmatrix} -\lambda_{n+1} \\ -\lambda_{n+2} \\ \vdots \\ -\lambda_{n+m} \end{pmatrix} \leq \vec{0}$, $\forall \vec{y} \in P^n$.

that is, $\lambda_{n+1}, \dots, \lambda_{n+m} \geq 0$

Since we can write $A \vec{y}^T - \begin{pmatrix} -\lambda_{n+1} \\ -\lambda_{n+2} \\ \vdots \\ -\lambda_{n+m} \end{pmatrix} = A \vec{y}^T + \begin{pmatrix} \lambda_{n+1} \\ \lambda_{n+2} \\ \vdots \\ \lambda_{n+m} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ \vdots \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$ as

$$y_1 \vec{a}_1 + y_2 \vec{a}_2 + \dots + y_n \vec{a}_n + \lambda_{n+1} \vec{e}_1 + \lambda_{n+2} \vec{e}_2 + \dots + \lambda_{n+m} \vec{e}_m = \vec{0}, (*)$$

where $\vec{y} = (y_1, y_2, \dots, y_n) \in P^n$

If we take $s = y_1 + y_2 + \dots + y_n + \lambda_{n+1} + \lambda_{n+2} + \dots + \lambda_{n+m}$, then divided by s on both sides of $(*)$, we have $\frac{y_1}{s} \vec{a}_1 + \dots + \frac{y_n}{s} \vec{a}_n + \frac{\lambda_{n+1}}{s} \vec{e}_1 + \dots + \frac{\lambda_{n+m}}{s} \vec{e}_m = \vec{0}$, where $\frac{y_1}{s}, \dots, \frac{y_n}{s}, \frac{\lambda_{n+1}}{s}, \dots, \frac{\lambda_{n+m}}{s} \geq 0$ and $\frac{y_1}{s} + \dots + \frac{y_n}{s} + \frac{\lambda_{n+1}}{s} + \dots + \frac{\lambda_{n+m}}{s} = 1$.

Since $C = \text{Conv}(\vec{a}_1, \dots, \vec{a}_n, \vec{e}_1, \dots, \vec{e}_m)$, we conclude from $(\#)$ that $\vec{0} \in C$.